

MARICOPA COUNTY COMMISSION ON TRIAL COURT APPOINTMENTS

MINUTES

December 11, 2020

PRESENT: Justice Clint Bolick; Barry Aarons; Shawn Cox; Steve Perica; Abby Raddatz; Amanda Reeve; Paul Senseman and Stephen Silverman.

TELEPHONE: Leonard Gilroy and Peggy Baze

ABSENT: Jessica Everett-Garcia and Walt Opaska

Justice Bolick called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m.

Introductions

Justice Bolick introduced himself and noted a quorum of the Commission. He welcomed new member, Abby Raddatz and asked her to introduce herself. He thanked the Commission members for their availability and thanked the public members present and on the phone.

Public Comment

Justice Bolick explained to the public that the Commission would be screening applications for two vacancies on the Maricopa County Superior Court created by the retirement of Judges Douglas Gerlach and Jeanne Garcia. He mentioned that members of the public who submitted a request to speak at this meeting would be limited to two minutes each. He proceeded to call on each speaker present first, then those by phone.

Michael Blair spoke on behalf of Lauren Guyton.

Douglas Magnum spoke on behalf of Lauren Guyton.

Mark Ashton spoke on behalf of James Drake.

Krizia Verplancke spoke on behalf of Ashley Villaverde Halvorson.

Janine Baresco spoke on behalf of Lisa Wahlin.

Sarah Barnes spoke on behalf of Lisa Wahlin.

Benjamin Taylor spoke on behalf of Harla Davison, Lauren Guyton, Julie LaFave, Michael Kielsky and Michael Gottfried.

Michelle Lombino spoke on behalf of Michael Gottfried.

Rachel Mitchell spoke on behalf of Scott Blum.

Logan Elia spoke on behalf of David McDowell.

Rob Gordon spoke on behalf of Amy Kalman.

Daniel Gauthier spoke on behalf of David McDowell.

Francisco Salomon spoke on behalf of Harla Davison.

Approval of Minutes

Justice Bolick asked if any member wished to submit changes or additions to the draft minutes of the July 21 and July 22, 2020 interview meetings. It was moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Disqualifications and Disclosures

Justice Bolick inquired about any basis for additional disqualification or disclosure not previously mentioned, pursuant to the Commission's rules regarding conflict of interest or bias.

Justice Bolick disclosed that he met with Ashley Villaverde Halvorson and Melody Garland Harmon regarding the application process.

Steve Perica disclosed that he spoke to Lisa Wahlin regarding the application process.

Amanda Reeve disclosed that she spoke to Michael Gottfried and met with Lisa Wahlin, Melody Garland Harmon and Amy Kalman regarding the application process. She also disclosed that she is recused on voting on Glenn Allen.

Shawn Cox disclosed that she spoke to Julie LaFave, Lisa Wahlin and Amy Kalman regarding the application process and that she is recused from voting on Scott Blum.

Abby Radattz disclosed that she is recused from voting on David Garbarino since she is one of his son's godmother and is also recused on Stasy Click who is a close friend. She also disclosed that James Drake's wife was her son's pre-school teacher. She knows Michael Kielsky through a professional organization and spoke to Ashley Villaverde Halvorson, Amy Kalman and Melody Garland Harmon regarding the application process.

Stephen Silverman disclosed that he spoke to Amy Kalman and Lisa Wahlin regarding the application process and that Stasy Click's husband will be working on some unrelated issues with him.

Barry Aarons disclosed that he met with Amy Kalman and Lisa Wahlin regarding the application process.

Leonard Gilroy disclosed that he spoke to Amy Kalman, Lisa Wahlin and Michael Gottfried regarding the application process and has had professional engagements with Michael Gottfried in the past.

Discussion of Applicants and Interviews and Selection of Nominees

Justice Bolick opened the floor for discussion on applicants. He reminder the Commission he only votes in case of a tie.

Barry Aarons moved to go into executive session at 10:17 a.m. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The Commission returned to public session at 10:30 a.m.

The Commission took turns discussing the applicants and their qualifications in alphabetical order.

The Commission suggested a straw vote to focus discussion of applicants and all those who receive more than 3 will be further discussed. The results of the vote were:

Glenn Allen – 6
Scott Blum – 5
Stasy Click – 5
Francisca Cota – 2
Harla Davison – 3
James Drake, Jr. – 8
Paula Eaton – 2
Elizabeth Fleming – 0

David Garbarino – 6
Melody Garland Harmon – 7
Michael Gottfried – 1
Laura Guyton – 9
Amy Kalman – 8
Michael Kielsky – 2
Julie LaFave – 7
Stephen Little – 4
David McDowell – 7
Sigmund Popko – 7
Jeremy Rovinsky – 0
Andrew Russell – 9
Ashley Villaverde Halvorson – 9
Lisa Wahlin – 9

The Commission took turns discussing the results of the votes.

Selection of Applicants to be Interviewed

Justice Bolick opened the floor for individual nominations to a tentative interview list.

Stephen Silverman moved to interview all applicants who received a majority vote which include: **Glen Allen, Scott Blum, Stasy Click, James Drake, Jr., David Garbarino, Melody Garland Harmon, Lauren Guyton, Amy Kalman, Julie LaFave, David McDowell, Sigmund Popko, Andrew Russell, Ashley Villaverde Halvorson** and **Lisa Wahlin**. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Discussion of Interview Schedule and Interview Questions

The Commission addressed the logistics of the pending interviews. Justice Bolick mentioned that the interviews will be held in person, but members of the public could speak and view the proceedings via Zoom. The Commission agreed on holding 15-minute interviews with a potential hypothetical question on January 7, 2021 starting at 8:30 a.m.

Staff was directed to create the due diligence assignments.

Justice Bolick encouraged Commission members to submit questions before the executive session meeting.

Adjournment

Justice Bolick thank the Commission for their work. Paul Senseman moved to adjourn the meeting at 11:06 a.m. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.